



| | 200 | 1 | 2 | 3 | X | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 |
|----|-------------|---|---|--------|----|------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| | | X | | | | 3 6 9 2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| s | 9 | 7 | 8 | د 9 | /: | 9 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 25 | 3 6 9 | | | | | | - | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 25 | 3 6 9 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |





Experiments were conducted on the equipment of the Holland Computing Center at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln. This research was supported by NSF Grant No. RI-1619344. Howell was supported by a UCARE grant.

Solving Sudoku with Consistency: A Visual and Interactive Approach Ian Howell¹ Robert J.Woodward^{1,2} Berthe Y.Choueiry¹ Christian Bessiere² ¹Constraint Systems Laboratory • University of Nebraska-Lincoln • USA ²LIRMM-CNRS • Université de Montpellier • France

| | | | 、ノ | 0 |) | ſ | | S | | | S | t | E |) (| ncy Algorithms | |
|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|----------------------------|---------------------------------|---|----|----------------------------|--|--------------------------|---|--|---|--|----------------|--|---|
| 23 56 89 23 56 89 6 | 1 4 7 1 4 7 | 258 2258 258 | 3 6 9 3 6 9 | 1 4 7 | 1 2 3 5 9 8 | 35 | 147 147 147 | 258 258 258 258 | 369 369 369 369 | 1 4 7 1 4 7 1 4 7 | 258 258 258 258 | 3 6 9 3 6 9 3 6 9 | 1 2 4 5 7 8 1 2 7 8 7 8 | 369 369 | | |
| 23 56 89 9 23 | 1 4 7 1 4 7 | 258 258 258 | 369 369 36 | 1 4 7 1 | 2 3 6 9 9 9 | 3 | 1 4 7 1 4 7 | 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 | 3693693 | 1 4 7 1 4 7 1 | 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 | 3 6 9 3 6 9 3 | 1 2 4 5 7 8 1 2 | 369 | AC | |
| 56 89 8 23 56 89 | 4 7 4 7 1 4 7 | 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 | 69 369 369 | 4 7 4 7 1 4 7 | 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 2 5 8 5 8 | 3 | 4 7 1 4 7 | 5 8 2 5 8 4 | 6 9 3 6 9 | 4 7 1 4 7 | 5 8 5 2 5 8 | 6 9 3 6 9 | 4 5 7 8 1 2 4 5 7 8 | 69 9 369 | $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 2 |

| | | | | | | | | | 5 | | | r_ | 4 | | | | |
|-----------------------|---|----------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------|---|----------------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|--|----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|------------------|--------------------|----------|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5 | 3 | 4 7 | 5 | 9 | | 1 | | 7 | 2 8 | 3 6 9 | 4 7 | 2 8 | 3 6 9 | 7 | 2 | 3 6 | |
| 5 | 3 | | 2 | | 4 | 5 | 3 9 | 1 | 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 | 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 | | 3 6 | |
| 6 | | 4 7 | | | | 8 | | 1 7 | 2 | 3 | 1 4 7 | 2 | 3 | | 5 | | |
| 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | | 7 | • | | 25 | 3 | | 2 | 3 | | 2 | 3 | |
| | | | 8 | | | - | | | 8 | 9 | | 8 | 6 9 | | | 0 | |
| 9 | | 1 | 8 8 | | | 2 5 | 3 | 1 7 | 8 2 5 8 | 9 3 | 1 7 | 8 2 8 | 6 9 3 | | 4 | 0 | |
| 9 5 | 3 | 1 1 4 | 8 5 8 5 8 | 6 | 4 | 2 5 5 | 3 3 6 | 1 7 1 7 | 8 258 58 | 9 3 3 6 | 1 7 1 7 | 8 2 8 8 | 6 9 3 6 | 1 7 | 4 | 36 | |
| 9 5 8 | 3 | 1 1 4 1 4 7 | 8 5 8 5 8 | 6 | 4 | 2 5 5 2 | 3 3 6 | 1 7 1 7 1 | 8 2 5 8 5 8 2 5 8 2 | 9 3 3 6 3 6 | 1 7 1 7 | 8 2 8 8 | 6 9 3 3 6 | 1 7 | 4 | 36 | |
| 9 5 8 2 5 | 3 | 1 1 4 7 1 7 | 8 5 8 5 8 5 8 | 6 6 9 | 4 | 2 5 5 2 2 5 | 3 36 6 9 | 1 7 1 7 7 | 8 2 5 8 5 8 2 5 8 2 | 9 3 3 6 3 6 | 1 7 1 7 1 7 | 8 2 8 5 2 | 69 3 36 36 | 1 7 1 7 | 4 9 2 | 36 36 | |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | 1 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------|--------|--------|-------------|--------|---|---|-------------|---|-------------|--------|---|-------------|--------|--------|---|--------|--------|--------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|---|
| 4 | 5 8 | 3 6 | 4 | 2 5 | 3 | 4 | 2 5 8 | S | 4 7 | 5 | 3 | 4 7 | 5 | 9 | | 1 | _ | 7 | 2 8 | 3 6 9 | 4 7 | 2 8 | 369 | 7 | 2 |
| 1 4 | 5 8 | 3 6 | 1 4 | 5 | 3 | | 7 | | 4 | 5 | 3 | | 2 | | 4 | 5 | 3 9 | 1 | 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 4 | 8 | 3 6 9 | 1 | |
| 1 4 | | 3 | | 9 | | 4 | 2 | 3 | | 6 | | 4 7 | | | | 8 | | 1 7 | 2 | 3 | 1 4 7 | 2 | 3 | | Ę |
| 4 | 5 8 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | | 1 | | 4 | 2 5 | 3 | 4 | 5 8 | 6 | | 7 | | | 2 5 8 | 3 6 9 | | 2 8 | 3 6 9 | | 2 |
| 7 | 5 8 | 3 | | 6 | | | 5 8 | 3 | | 9 | | 1 | 5 8 | | | 2 5 | 3 | 1 7 | 2 5 8 | 3 | 1 7 | 2 8 | 3 | | 4 |
| | 2 | | 4 7 | 5 | 3 | | 9 | | 1 4 | 5 | 3 | 1 4 | 5 8 | 6 | 4 | 5 | 3 6 | 1 7 | 5 8 | 3 6 | 1 7 | 8 | 3 6 | 1 7 | |
| 1 4 7 | | 3 | 1 4 7 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | | 8 | | 1 4 7 | | 6 | 4 | 2 | 6 | 1 7 | 2 | 3 6 | | 5 | | | g |
| 1 7 | 5 | 3 9 | | 8 | | | 2 5 | 3 | 1 7 | 2 5 | | 1 7 | 5 | 6 9 | | 2 5 | 69 | | 4 | • | 1 7 | 2 | 3 6 | 1 7 | 2 |
| 1 4 7 | 5 | 9 | 1 4 7 | 2 5 | | | 6 | | 1 4 7 | 25 | | | 3 | | 4 | 25 | 9 | 1 7 | 2 | | 1 7 | 2 | | | 8 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

POGAC

| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 23 6 7 13 |
|--|--------------------|
| | 1 3 |
| $\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 & 1 & 3 \\ 4 & 5 & 6 & 4 & 5 \\ 8 & 8 & 7 & 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 3 & 3 & 2 & 3 & 1 & 1 & 3 & 1 \\ 4 & 5 & 2 & 4 & 5 & 9 & 8 & 9 & 8 & 9 \\ 8 & 9 & 8 & 9 & 8 & 9 & 8 & 9 \end{bmatrix}$ | 6 |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 5 |
| 4 5 4 5 1 4 5 6 7 2 2 3 6 8 9 | 23 6 |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 4 |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 1 3 6 7 |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 9 |
| $\begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 5 \\ 9 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 5 \\ 5 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 5 \\ 5 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 5 \\ 5 \\ 9 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 5 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 5 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7 \\ 7$ | 12 6 7 |
| $ \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 4 \\ 5 \\ 9 \\ 7 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 4 \\ 5 \\ 7 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 2 \\ 4 \\ 5 \\ 7 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 3 \\ 7 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \\ 9 \\ 7 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 \\ + \begin{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \begin{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 2 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} 1 \\ + \end{array}{c} 1 $ | 8 |

| | 1 | | | 2 | 2 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | 9 | 1 | 8 | 3 | 2 |
| 3 | 2 | 5 | 9 | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | 4 | 8 | 1 | 7 | 5 |
| 2 | 8 | 7 | 6 | 9 | 3 |
| 9 | 1 | 3 | 5 | 2 | 4 |
| 5 | 6 | 4 | 7 | 8 | 1 |
| 8 | 7 | 6 | 3 | 5 | 9 |
| | 5 | 2 | 4 | 6 | 7 |
| | 3 | 9 | 2 | 1 | 8 |

BiSGAC

Open Question

SSGAC can solve every 9x9 Sudoku puzzle in our Database including the 375 hardest known instances. However, determining the weakest level of consistency sufficient to solve any 9x9 Sudoku puzzle remains an